

Minutes of the
Oahu Metropolitan Planning Organization

POLICY COMMITTEE

Thursday, January 5, 2006, 9:00 a.m.
Honolulu Hale, Council Committee Room, Room 205
530 South King Street, Honolulu, Hawaii

Members Present:

Representative Marilyn Lee, Chair	Councilmember Gary Okino
Councilmember Todd Apo, Vice Chair	Senator Will Espero
Councilmember Romy Cachola	Senator Brian Kanno
Councilmember Charles Djou	Rodney Haraga, DOT Director
Councilmember Ann Kobayashi	Alfred Tanaka, Acting DTS Director

Members Absent: Representative Mark Moses, Representative Joseph Souki, Senator Lorraine Inouye

Invited Resource Guests Present: Laura Thielen (DBEDT-OP Director) and Kathy Sokugawa (DPP, for Director Henry Eng)

Guests Present:

Representative Rida Cabanilla	Charles Carole (NB #10, CAC, Vice Chair)
Dennis Galolo (CImbr Cachola staff)	David Aki (NB #25, CAC)
Robert Sato (CImbr Okino staff)	Michael Golojuch (NB #34, CAC)
Ronald Tsuzuki (DOT)	Richard Kane (Pacific Resource Partnership, CAC)
Glenn Yasui (DOT)	Michael Costa (Teamsters Local 996, CAC)
Brian Suzuki (DTS)	Gladys Quinto (Land Use Research Fndtn, CAC)
Liz Fischer (FHWA)	Tom Berg (Oahu resident)
Bob McGraw (American Plng. Assn., CAC)	Dick Kaku (Kaku Associates)
Joe Magaldi (Committee for Balanced Transportation, CAC, Chair)	Mark Scheibe (Parsons Brinckerhoff)

OMPO Staff Present: Gordon Lum (Executive Director), Shevaun Low, Pamela Toyooka

Chair Marilyn Lee called the meeting to order at 9:05 a.m. A quorum was present. Chair Lee recognized the presence of Kathy Sokugawa, representing the City Department of Planning and Permitting (DPP) for Director Henry Eng, the invited resource person from DPP.

Chair Lee explained that, due to a scheduling conflict, the meeting would need to either end at or be recessed at 10:45 a.m., with a continuation meeting to follow.

I. MINUTES OF THE DECEMBER 20, 2005 MEETING

Senator Will Espero asked that Senator Brian Kanno's "no" vote for the raises for the excluded exempt employees be included in the minutes. Pamela Toyooka clarified that Senator Kanno had voted for the Office Manager's raise and against the Executive Director's raise. Ms. Toyooka stated that the minutes, as written, reflect Senator Kanno's vote against the Executive Director's raise.

Vice Chair Todd Apo asked that the minutes be amended to reflect the complexity of the issue of the inability of a greater number of Policy Committee members to attend the Oahu Regional Transportation Plan (ORTP) islandwide public meeting, due to the Sunshine Law.

There being no objections, the minutes of the December 20, 2005 meeting were approved as amended.

Chair Lee recognized Laura Thielen, the invited resource person from the Department of Business, Economic Development, and Tourism, and requested that she join the Committee at the table.

[Senator Brian Kanno arrived at 9:09 a.m.]

II. DRAFT OF THE FINANCIALLY CONSTRAINED 2030 ORTP

Preliminary Draft Constrained Transportation Plan

Handout: Draft 2030 ORTP Constrained Plan Project List with Estimated Costs

[Councilmember Romy Cachola arrived at 9:16 a.m., during the presentation.]

Dick Kaku of Kaku Associates (KA), OMPO's consultant, gave a presentation on the preliminary draft constrained transportation plan. Mr. Kaku noted that project #336 was no longer on the constrained list.

Discussion – *Mr. Kaku answered the members' questions (members' last names in parentheses).*

- (Cachola) Project #336 (Salt Lake Boulevard, Widening, from east of Bougainville Drive to Maluna Street) is not listed on the constrained list, because it is already a part of the baseline – meaning that the project is committed to be built by 2030.

Financial Workshop

Mark Scheibe of Parsons Brinckerhoff, KA's subconsultant, gave a financial workshop presentation.

Discussion – *Unless otherwise noted, Mr. Scheibe and Mr. Kaku answered the members' questions (members' last names in parentheses).*

- (Okino) (Project #431B,440 – Rail Transit, Kapolei to Manoa) The revenue for the rail transit project has not been separated from revenue for the other projects. The costs (such as, operations and maintenance for bus and rail) have been separated. The operations and maintenance cost estimate for rail will be provided to the Policy Committee at the continuation meeting.
- (Espero) Breaking up Project #431B,440 into two separate projects could be done in an attempt to secure additional federal transit funds. However, a conservative approach in projecting revenues is taken – such that one rail transit project is being used in the ORTP – because it would take longer to implement two projects.

- (Espero) Expansion of the rail transit project into two projects is possible. An extension of the proposed rail system could qualify for additional New Starts Discretionary funds.
- (Kanno) (Projects #130 – Interstate Route H-1, HOV Lanes, Waiawa Interchange to Makakilo Interchange) The high-occupancy vehicle (HOV) lanes would be constructed on a currently unpaved median. The Project Description will be revised to reflect this.
- (Kanno) (Project #145 – Interstate Route H-2, New Interchange, Kipapa Gulch) References to “Kipapa Gulch” and “Plantation Road Overpass” in the Facility/Project Title and the Project Description will be changed to “Pineapple Road Overpass”.
- Hawaii Department of Transportation (HDOT) Director Rodney Haraga stated that, per the American Association of State Highway and Transportation Officials, the state department of transportation directors have been cautioned that they should not depend on fuel taxes in the future. Fuel tax should not be considered as a revenue source.
- (Kanno) HDOT Highway Administrator Glenn Yasui stated that the pending project to extend Roosevelt Avenue in Kalaeloa to connect it to Kamokila Boulevard is not eligible for State or federal funds. HDOT Head Planning Engineer Ronald Tsuzuki stated that this is a City project; the Department of Transportation Services (DTS) is working on it, and Campbell Estate is involved. DTS Director Alfred Tanaka stated that DTS will follow-up on this.
- (Espero/Apo) (Project #6 – Ferry, Intra-Island Express Commuter, Iroquois Point to Honolulu Harbor) “Iroquois Point” in the Facility/Project Title will be changed to “Ocean Pointe Marina”. “(Iroquois Point)” will be deleted from the Project Description. The project map will be corrected.
- (Cachola) There is no ideal length for a rail transit line; the issue is not so much about total length, as it is about going from an outlying area(s) into the downtown area (central business district).
- (Cachola) Gordon Lum stated that, for the ORTP, it is not critical if the rail transit project is done as one or two projects. It is more important that the rail transit corridor is identified in the ORTP, from a federal funding eligibility perspective; the specific details of the project are not a major factor for the ORTP. The details will be developed through the City’s Alternatives Analysis (AA) and Draft Environmental Impact Statement (DEIS) process.
- (Cachola) In developing the ORTP constrained plan, the rail transit project was analyzed separately from the rest of the plan when looking at the revenue/cost issue. So, the revenues and costs of the rapid transit project did not affect the rest of the plan.
- (Cachola/Espero) Mr. Lum stated that whether a project is defined as one project or two projects will be determined in the City’s AA/DEIS process. The project must be justified and quantified in the EIS process. In the statement of project purpose and need, the EIS will state whether the proposal will include one or two projects. If the purpose and need justified moving toward two projects, then it would be advantageous to go with two projects. However, this would be outside of the ORTP process.

- (Apo) (Project 265 – Kapolei Parkway, Extension, Kamokila Boulevard to Papipi Road) Some of the projects in the plan will be done by developers. This project is being done by developers.
- (Apo) Regarding the lack of an Interstate Route H-1 widening project from Pali to Punahou off-ramp, Mr. Kaku stated that the consultant's recommendations for H-1 widening projects are based on HDOT's recommendation. Mr. Yasui stated that, currently, the configuration of H-1 would require additional rights-of-way acquisition and would disrupt traffic in the area. Instead, Transportation Systems Management-type projects are being done in this area; they include restriping and minor widening in order to increase the capacity of local areas, rather than the entire corridor. In addition, for this portion of Interstate Route H-1, it would be controversial to close the Ward Avenue on-ramp in the eastbound direction. There would be substantial opposition.
- (Apo) Widening and adding an HOV lane from Kunia Interchange through Pearl City is the most cost-effective way, within the context of the entire plan, to address the growth in the Ewa area. It is hoped that the extension of the HOV lane will encourage more HOV conversion and take care of a lot of the growth. The combination of the HOV lane and the rail transit line out to Kapolei will create a significant change in the mode of travel.
- Vice Chair Apo voiced his concern about the bottleneck at the Interstate Routes H-1/H-2 merge through Pearl City. A Pearl Harbor crossing would address the bottleneck; however, it is not included in the plan.
- (Apo) (Project 254 – Kamehameha Highway, Widening, Kahuhipa Street to Pali Highway) There was an identified deficiency in the baseline analysis for this area.
- (Apo) (Project 18, Bike Plan Hawaii – Oahu) The estimated cost for this project includes all the necessary planning and design processing costs for the State's bikeway plan for Oahu; this plan has been approved and adopted.
- (Kobayashi) Mr. Yasui stated that widening or improving the on-ramp near Dole Street at Alexander might be part of the University Interchange improvements. Specifics of the project would be part of the design process.
- (Cachola) (Project 304 – Nimitz Highway, HOV Flyover, Keehi Interchange to Pacific Street) The Middle Street to Waikiki corridor is very congested; and this project made technical sense. Even if rail transit has a significant impact when it is built, 90% of the people will still be driving along this corridor. It is hoped that more people will carpool and vanpool. Any one project is not the answer; a combination of projects is needed.

Chair Lee announced that a meeting continuation would be held at 3:00 p.m. on Friday, January 13, 2006 in the City Council Committee Room. Testimony will be taken at that time.

The meeting was recessed at 10:50 a.m.



Meeting Continuation
of the Oahu Metropolitan Planning Organization

POLICY COMMITTEE

Friday, January 13, 2006, 3:00 p.m.
Honolulu Hale, Council Committee Room, room 205
530 South King Street, Honolulu, Hawaii

Members Present:

Representative Marilyn Lee, Chair	Representative Joseph Souki
Councilmember Todd Apo, Vice Chair	Senator Will Espero
Councilmember Romy Cachola	Senator Brian Kanno
Councilmember Ann Kobayashi	Rodney Haraga, DOT Director
Councilmember Gary Okino	Alfred Tanaka, Acting DTS Director
Representative Mark Moses	

Members Absent: Councilmember Charles Djou, Senator Lorraine Inouye

Invited Resource Guests Present: Kathy Sokugawa (DPP, for Director Henry Eng)

Guests Present:

Representative Rida Cabanilla	Charles Carole (NB #10, CAC, Vice Chair)
Dennis Galolo (Clmbr Cachola staff)	Richard Kane (Pacific Resource Partnership, CAC)
Robert Sato (Clmbr Okino staff)	Tom Berg (Oahu resident)
Hamid Jahanmir (DBEDT-OP)	Dick Kaku (Kaku Associates)
Ronald Tsuzuki (DOT)	Mark Scheibe (Parsons Brinckerhoff)
Bob McGraw (American Plng. Assn., CAC)	

OMPO Staff Present: Gordon Lum (Executive Director), Shevaun Low, Pamela Toyooka

Chair Marilyn Lee called the meeting to order at 3:06 p.m. A quorum was present.

Kathy Sokugawa, representing DPP's Director Henry Eng, stated DPP's concern about giving the impression that the developer-contribution of 34% was attributed to all the developer-funded projects. In some cases, the developer's contribution would be well more than 34%.

Mr. Kaku responded that the financial plan included an estimate of private developer contributions. Five years ago, the Ewa Highway Master Plan (EHMP) was developed. The EHMP was used to come up with the Ewa Impact Fee Program data and included an analysis of all new highways and improvements to existing highways at that time. This analysis also included the cost of highway improvements and the fair share responsibility (percentage) for the private sector for each of those improvements. That number was then applied to the total cost for the dozen or so projects in the original EHMP; the average cost for the developers came out to be 34%. As a result of this process, 34% is used as a planning estimate for each of the improvements in the ORTP that may have a private developer contribution.

Mr. Kaku noted that, in the ORTP report, a caveat is included that clearly states that 34% developer contribution is only to be used as a planning factor. The 34% does not imply that: 1) it is fixed; 2) it be used for specific transportation improvements; or 3) it be used collectively for all developer-related transportation improvements at this time. A developer contribution of 34% represents a good guess, at this time, of what the ultimate private sector participation will be for these improvements.

[Senator Brian Kanno arrived at 3:10 p.m., during the above discussion.]

Testimony

Those who had signed up to give oral testimony were not present (Representative Rida Cabanilla and Tom Berg). Both testifiers had previously submitted written testimony. The meeting was recessed at 3:12 p.m., while extra copies of the written testimony were made. The meeting was reconvened at 3:14 p.m. Written testimonies from both testifiers were distributed to the members and to those in the public that were interested in receiving it. Everyone was given an opportunity to read the written testimony.

Alfred Tanaka moved and Senator Will Espero seconded that the draft 2030 ORTP financially-constrained list of projects be endorsed for public review and comment.

[Representative Joseph Souki arrived at 3:20 p.m.]

Mr. Lum gave a brief overview of the draft list of projects. Mr. Lum added that, with regard to the Policy Committee Task Force that was appointed to investigate the Island-wide meeting for the draft 2030 ORTP, the Office of Information Practices had opined that it would be acceptable to have alternates attend in place of the task force members.

Mr. Lum stated that, at the January 5, 2006 portion of the meeting, the members had requested information. The responses to those requests are as follows:

- Rail transit cost for operation and maintenance used in the draft ORTP: \$575 million over the life of the ORTP.
- Status of Kamokila Boulevard extension from Roosevelt Avenue: DTS staff sent this information directly to Senator Kanno.

Mr. Lum stated that the following changes were made to the draft project list that was distributed at the January 5, 2006 portion of the meeting:

1. In response to members' requests, the following revisions to the descriptions of projects #130, #145, and #6 were made.
 - For #130, the words "new" and "in the freeway median" were added to the Project Description.
 - For #145, "Kipapa Gulch" and "Plantation Road Overpass" were replaced with "Pineapple Road Overpass".

- For #6, “Iroquois Point” was replaced with “Ocean Point Marina”; and “in Ewa” was added to the project description. A revised map of the ORTP projects showed the ferry project at Ocean Pointe Marina, rather than Iroquois Point.
2. In response to a request made by HDOT, the following change was made:
- For Project #271,272,273 (Kunia Road, Widening, Wilikina Drive to Farrington Highway), a fourth bullet was added: “Add 1 lane eastbound loop on-ramp at Kunia Road & Interstate Route H-1”.

Senator Kanno asked that “Improvements” be included in the Facility/Project Title for Project #271,272,273. Mr. Lum responded that this word would be included.

A vote was taken on the motion to endorse the draft 2030 ORTP financially-constrained list of projects for public review and comment. The motion carried unanimously.

Representative Mark Moses moved and Councilmember Ann Kobayashi seconded that an approach to financially constrain the 2030 ORTP be endorsed.

Mr. Lum presented the two options to financially constrain the 2030 ORTP. In order to reach the \$13.1 billion in revenue needed to fund the plan, additional revenue is needed to make up the budget shortfall. This can be achieved by one of the following two approaches:

1. Increase the State taxes – motor vehicle registration annual fee, transient accommodations tax
2. Increase the Oahu share of the Surface Transportation Program (STP) funds

In response to Senator Kanno’s and Representative Moses’ questions, Mr. Lum explained that, in order for all the projects in the current draft plan to be included, additional funds would need to be found to make up the budget shortfall. Mr. Kaku stated that the budget shortfall is estimated to be \$500 million over 25 years.

Mr. Kaku explained that the Policy Committee had adopted the option of increasing taxes in the last ORTP; so, this was viewed as an acceptable way to make adjustments to the available revenue. Mr. Kaku added that, in looking at the financial plan for the ORTP, one difference from previous ORTP plans was that HDOT, in an effort to equalize what they felt were previous shortcomings of their financial plan and to ensure that certain major projects from the Neighbor Islands could be funded, suggested that, for planning purposes, the share of State-controlled STP funds be increased for the Neighbor Islands and reduced on Oahu. It was felt that this was an appropriate thing to do, but it wasn’t a necessary change for the full 25-year period of the plan.

Mr. Kaku recommended the second option – to increase the STP funds for the Neighbor Islands for the first 5-10 years of the plan, then slowly revert the percentages back to the original historical Oahu percentage for the rest of the plan. He noted that the use of the word “increase” in option 2 is a misnomer.

Representative Moses amended the original motion to endorse option two, with a change of wording to better describe the option – “Reestablish the historical trend for Oahu’s share of the

Surface Transportation Program funds". The friendly amendment to the motion was accepted. A vote was taken on the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

Testimony

Representative Rida Cabanilla: Representative Cabanilla testified in favor of including a Pearl Harbor Emphasis in the Illustrative category of the 2030 ORTP.

Tom Berg (Ewa resident): Mr. Berg requested clarification on Project #6. Mr. Berg also requested the status of the \$50,000 needed for the railroad ties for the preservation effort by the Hawaiian Railway Society. Mr. Ronald Tsuzuki responded that only State funds would be used for this effort; so, the project does not need to be in the Transportation Improvement Program. Mr. Tsuzuki was not sure of the exact status of the funds, but assured Mr. Berg that the funds would be released.

There being no other business or announcements, the meeting was adjourned at 3:40 p.m.