

Meeting Summary of the
Oahu Metropolitan Planning Organization

CITIZEN ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Wednesday, October 17, 2007, 3:30 p.m.
Mayor's Conference Room
Honolulu Hale, Room 301
530 South King Street, Honolulu, Hawaii

Members Present:

NB #10 Makiki-Lower Punchbowl-Tantalus
Committee for Balanced Transportation
American Society of Civil Engineers
American Society of Landscape Architects
Castle & Cooke Homes Hawaii
Charley's Taxi
Committee for Balanced Transportation
E Noa Corporation
Eye of the Pacific
Hawaii Bicycling League
Hawaii Highway Users Alliance
Hawaii Teamsters and Allied Workers, Local 996
Interagency COORDINATION Councils
NB #01 Hawaii Kai
NB #03 Waialae-Kahala
NB #05 Diamond Head-Kapahulu-Saint Louis Heights
NB #08 McCully-Moiliili
NB #14 Liliha-Alewa-Puunui-Kamehameha Heights
NB #18 Aliamanu-Salt Lake-Foster Village
NB #23 Ewa
NB #24 Waianae Coast
NB #25 Mililani-Waipio-Melemanu
NB #34 Makakilo-Kapolei-Honokai Hale
NB #35 Mililani Mauka-Launani Valley
Pacific Resource Partnership
Sierra Club Hawaii Chapter
Waianae Coast Transportation Concerns Group
Waikiki Residents Association

Charles Carole, Chair
Joe Magaldi, Jr., Vice Chair
Tiffany Hamada
Chris Dacus
Dean Minakami
Dale Evans
Frank Genadio
Tom Dinell
Patricia Blum
Scott Snider
Darcianne Evans
Michael Costa
CC Curry
Greg Knudsen
Lester Fukuda
Bert Narita
Ron Lockwood
Arvid Youngquist
Lorene Godfrey
R. Scott Belford
David Brown
David Aki
Michael Golojuch
Pamela Young
Richard Kane
Randy Ching
Dick Boddy
Daisy Murai

Members Absent (Reps):

American Planning Association
Hawaii Transportation Association
Honolulu Community Action Program
Institute of Transportation Engineers
Land Use Research Foundation

John Valera
Gareth Sakakida
Vai Leatiota
Peter Pascua
David Arakawa

League of Women Voters
Leeward Oahu Transportation Management Association
NB #02 Kuliouou-Kalani Iki
NB #09 Waikiki
NB #12 Nuuanu-Punchbowl
NB #13 Downtown
NB #21 Pearl City
NB #22 Waipahu
NB #26 Wahiawa
NB #27 North Shore
NB #30 Kaneohe
North Shore Chamber of Commerce
Tax Foundation of Hawaii

Jacqueline Parnell
David Arakawa
Linda Starr
Robert Finley
Jay Fidell
Burton White
Cruz J. Vina, Jr.
Thomas Maus
Robert Kent
Antya Miller
Wendell Lum
Gil Riviere
Lowell Kalapa

Guests Present:

Mary Protheroe
Ben Gorospe
Tammy Lee
Councilmember Ann Kobayashi
Alan S. Lloyd
Cliff Slater
Janet Inamine
Carl Jacobs
Doug Chun
Nalani Dahl
Steve Hogan

AARP
Department of Transportation
DOT
Honolulu City Council
HonoluluTraffic.com
HonoluluTraffic.com
Moiliili resident
NB #20 Aiea
Office of Council Services
Parsons Brinkerhoff
Parsons Brinkerhoff

OMPO Staff Present:

Gordon Lum (Executive Director) and Marian Yasuda

Chair Charles Carole called the meeting to order at 3:31 p.m. A quorum was present.

1. Approval of the September 19, 2007 Meeting Minutes

Rich Kane moved and Pat Blum seconded that the September 19, 2007 meeting minutes be approved as circulated.

Discussion: Ron Lockwood requested that future minutes include three or four sentences summarizing the presentations provided at the meetings.

The motion carried unanimously.

2. “Assessing the Financial Risks of Major Transit Projects”

Mr. Cliff Slater gave a presentation on the financial risks that should be considered when undertaking a significant transit project, such as the Honolulu High-Capacity Transit Corridor Project. Mr. Slater presented cost differences between the estimates made during the Alternatives Analysis (AA)/Draft Environmental Impact Statement (DEIS) process and the actual construction costs for several transit

projects in the United States. Mr. Slater cited sources such as the U.S. Department of Transportation Federal Transit Administration (FTA) and the Pickerel Report.

Discussion Highlights:

[Note: Unless otherwise specified, questions were answered by Mr. Slater.]

- In response to a question by Scott Snider: The cost of the Honolulu fixed guideway project will fall somewhere in the range of \$4.1 billion to \$7.2 billion; the range should be narrowed down to plus or minus 20 percent.
- In response to a question by Lorene Godfrey: Explanations of cost overruns were not given, but the costs have been adjusted to compensate for inflation. The University of Aalborg study of 258 transit projects around the world gives explanations as to why these projects typically go over budget.
- In response to a question by Mr. Kane: The DEIS numbers that are cited in this presentation are from the FTA document that was released in September 2007.
- In response to a comment by Dale Evans: The contractors should be less client-focused in their projections. The Pickerel Report points out that a constant reference point needs to be used when projecting costs for projects.
- In response to a series of questions by Arvid Youngquist: The AA/DEIS numbers are cost projections that were made at the time of the DEIS, adjusted to 2005 dollars. Costs of extensions to existing lines tend to be more accurately predicted than costs of totally new lines. Transit use in Hawaii has been declining about 1 percent per year in Hawaii even with the increase in traffic congestion. Other comparable cities' experiences should be used to evaluate the viability of fixed guideway in Hawaii. Mr. Slater indicated that his favorite system, heavy or light rail, is in the New York City due to its high ridership.
- In response to a question by Mr. Snider: A discussion of ridership and operating expense would be best addressed at another meeting. Capital costs are the most significant consideration.
- In response to a question by Carl Jacobs: No elevated systems were evaluated in the studies cited in the presentation.
- In response to a question by David Brown: No contractors were named in the reports cited, so no correlation to cost overruns could be attributed to any specific contractor.
- In response to a question by R. Scott Belford: The FTA considers 20 percent variation in costs to be acceptable. Voters do not have any impact on the implementation of a project once it is in the final EIS stage.
- In response to a question by Alan S. Lloyd: Each transit station will have park-and-ride, elevators, and escalators. The stations must be compliant with the Americans with Disabilities Act.
- In response to a question by Frank Genadio: There may be people who will give up one car to ride transit. Only 10 percent of the people will consider giving up a car, so the financial savings enjoyed is very small for most. Elevated buses would allow for faster door-to-door bus travel without the need for park-and-ride facilities.
- A comment offered by Darcianne Evans illustrated the contrast between the implementing agency's ability to spread information about the project and the average

citizen's limited resources to dispute information that they may feel is not factual.

- In response to a question by Mr. Belford: Because the heavy rail projects are mostly new projects, they tend to land in the upper end of the cost overruns scale.
- In response to a question by Randy Ching: Buses on an elevated guideway could operate twice as quickly than they currently do; eliminating the need to purchase 500 more buses for an elevated busway, as is indicated in the current AA.
- In response to a question by Mr. Kane: The FTA has been concerned with cost containment and not necessarily financial risks.
- In response to a question by Chair Carole: The cost estimates for the fixed guideway project will continue to increase as the costs of commodities increase and the value of the U.S. dollar goes down.
- In response to a question by Chris Dacus: Construction costs were adjusted for inflation, but not necessarily adjusted for increases in construction costs.

5. OahuMPO Meeting Highlights - Policy Committee & Technical Advisory Committee

There was neither a Policy Committee nor a Technical Advisory Committee meeting held since the CAC last met in September.

- There is no Technical Advisory Committee meeting scheduled at this time.
- A Policy Committee meeting is scheduled for October 22, 2007 at 10:00 a.m. in the Hawaii State Capitol Conference Room 309. At that meeting, it is expected that the Policy Committee will consider five items regarding the CAC:
 1. Membership request.
 2. Recommendations on the FY 2009 Overall Work Program.
 3. Reminder of Public-Private Partnership guidelines.
 4. Requesting the Policy Committee to urge the Senate Transportation Committee to hold a hearing on House Bill 70, House Draft 3.
 5. Requesting that the Citizen Advisory Committee Chair sit at the Policy Committee table.
- The Policy Committee is scheduled to receive a presentation called, "Solutions to Traffic Congestion - Oahu: Kapolei to UH Corridor".

6. Announcements

- Mr. Snider announced that this is his last CAC meeting. The Hawaii Bicycling League is currently searching for his replacement.
- Chair Carole announced a public forum sponsored by the League of Women Voters titled, "Rail - Not a Done Deal" that will take place on Saturday, October 27, 2007 at the Hawaii State Capitol, Room 224.
- Mr. Genadio provided a flyer on the City and County of Honolulu Transit Symposium that will take place on Tuesday, November 13, 2007, 8:00 a.m.-5 p.m., at the Neal Blaisdell Center - Pikake Room.

The meeting was adjourned at 4:31 p.m.